IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

PRESENT

THE HONOURABLE MR. JUSTICE A.MUHAMED MUSTAQUE

æ

THE HONOURABLE MR.JUSTICE P. KRISHNA KUMAR

THURSDAY, THE 28TH DAY OF NOVEMBER 2024 / 7TH AGRAHAYANA, 1946

WP(C) NO. 29247 OF 2019

PETITIONER :

KABEER C.
AGED 33 YEARS
S/O.SRAJU C,
CHORAMPADATH HOUSE,
PAVUKKONAM POST,
VANIYAMKULAM VIA,
PALAKKAD-679 522.

BY ADVS.

KALEESWARAM RAJ

SRI.VARUN C.VIJAY

KUM.THULASI K. RAJ

SMT.MAITREYI SACHIDANANDA HEGDE

RESPONDENTS :

- 1 STATE OF KERALA
 REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY,
 DEPARTMENT OF SOCIAL JUSTICE,
 SECRETARIAT, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM-695 001.
- DIRECTOR
 DEPARTMENT OF SOCIAL JUSTICE,
 THIRUVANANTHAPURAM-695 001.
- 3 SECRETARY TO GOVERNMENT DEPARTMENT OF LAW, SECRETARIAT, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM-695 001.



W.P.(C).Nos.29247/2019 and 1970/2024

-:**2**:- 2024:KER:98332

4 SECRETARY TO THE GOVERNMENT SOCIAL JUSTICE AND EMPOWERMENT DEPARTMENT, UNION OF INDIA, NEW DELHI

IS IMPLEADED AS ADDL.R4 AS PER ORDER DATED 08/12/2021 IN WPC 29247/2019.

ORUMA TRANSGENDERS COMMUNITY BASED ORGANISATION REG. NO.PKD/CA/426/2018, TRANSGENDER CANTEEN, CIVIL STATION, KAKKANAD-678 001; REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY MANJU RAJU, AGED 33 YEARS, FATHER RAJAN, PANNIPERUNTHALA, THEKKE DESOM, PALAKKAD-678 553

IS IMPLEADED AS ADDITIONAL 5TH RESPONDENT AS PER ORDER DATED 4/3/2022 IN I.A 1/22 IN WPC 29247/2019(S).

BY ADVS.

K.P.PRADEEP
HAREESH M.R.
SANAND RAMAKRISHNAN
NEENA ARIMBOOR
RASMI NAIR T.
T.THASMI
M.J.ANOOPA

SHRI.N.MANOJ KUMAR, STATE ATTORNEY K.R.RANJITH, GOVERNMENT PLEADER

KRISHNA T C, CGC

THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING COME UP FOR ADMISSION ON 28.11.2024, ALONG WITH WP(C).1970/2024, THE COURT ON THE SAME DAY DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING:



W.P.(C).Nos.29247/2019 and 1970/2024

-:**3**:- 2024:KER:98332

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

PRESENT

THE HONOURABLE MR. JUSTICE A.MUHAMED MUSTAQUE

ደ

THE HONOURABLE MR.JUSTICE P. KRISHNA KUMAR

THURSDAY, THE 28TH DAY OF NOVEMBER 2024 / 7TH AGRAHAYANA, 1946

WP(C) NO. 1970 OF 2024

PETITIONER:

ANEERA KABEER.C AGED 38 YEARS D/O. SRAJU, CHORAMPADTH, VANIAMKULAM, PAVUKKONAM, VTC: ANANGANADI. P.O., EDAKODE, PALAKKAD, KERALA, PIN - 679522

BY ADVS.

PADMA LAKSHMI

MARIYAMMA A.K.

HASEENA T.

RESPONDENTS:

- 1 STATE OF KERALA REPRESENTED BY CHIEF SECRETARY, GOVERNMENT SECRETARIAT, THIRUVANAMTHAPURAM: 695001, PIN - 695001
- 2 CHAIRMAN

 KERALA PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION,

 PATTOM PALACE P.O.

 THIRUVNAMTHAPURAM, PIN 695004



W.P.(C).Nos.29247/2019 and 1970/2024

-:**4**:- 2024:KER:98332

- 3 SECRETARY TO GOVT.

 SOCIAL JUSTICE DEPARTMENT VIKAS BHAVAN,

 5TH FLOOR, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM-695033,

 PIN 695033
- 4 LAW SECRETARY, LAW DEPARTMENT,
 LAW DEPARTMENT, ROOM NO:375,
 FIRST FLOOR, MAIN BLOCK,
 GOVERNMENT SECRETARIAT,
 THIRUVANAMTHAPURAM, PIN 695001
- *ADDL.R5 UNION OF INDIA,
 REPRESENTED BY ITS SECRETARY,
 MINISTRY OF SOCIAL JUSTICE AND EMPOWERMENT,
 A-WING, SHASTRI BHAWAN,
 NEW DELHI 110 001.

[ADDL.R5 IS SUO MOTU IMPLEADED AS PER ORDER DATED 17.01.2024 IN WP(C) 1970/2024]

BY ADVS.
SHRI N.MANOJ KUMAR, STATE ATTORNEY
K.R.RANJITH, GOVERNMENT PLEADER
KRISHNA T C, CGC

THIS WRIT PETITION (CIVIL) HAVING COME UP FOR ADMISSION ON 28.11.2024, ALONG WITH WP(C).29247/2019, THE COURT ON THE SAME DAY DELIVERED THE FOLLOWING:



W.P.(C).Nos.29247/2019 and 1970/2024

-:5:-

2024:KER:98332

JUDGMENT

Dated this the 28th day of November 2024

A.Muhamed Mustaque, J.

Transgenders filed these writ petitions. They seek relief of a writ of mandamus directing the Government of Kerala to provide reservations to transgender persons in education and public employment. The earliest writ petition was filed in 2019. These writ petitions were filed in the light of the declaration of law by the Apex Court regarding the right of transgenders in **National Legal Services Authority v. Union of India and Ors. [(2014) 5 SCC 438]**. This Court passed various interim orders in the earliest writ petition, W.P.(C). No.29247/2019. However, nothing has come out effectively to provide reservations to the transgenders. We also note that the Government has taken various measures to



W.P.(C).Nos.29247/2019 and 1970/2024

-:**6**:- 2024:KER:98332

assist transgenders through different Government orders from 2015 onwards. Yet, the Government failed to evolve policies providing reservations to transgenders.

- 2. While ordinarily this Court may not interfere in the policy domain of the Government, in cases involving fundamental rights and a clear direction from the Apex Court existing, the judicial role in enforcing such rights become imperative. The continued inaction by the Government, despite clear legal and constitutional obligations, leaves this Court with little choice but to consider issuing appropriate directions to ensure compliance with the constitutional and legal mandate. But in this case, the rights of transgenders have been declared by the Apex Court in the National Legal Services Authority's case (supra), declaring the law as follows:
- "135. We, therefore, declare:
- **135.1.** Hijras, eunuchs, apart from binary genders, be treated as "third gender" for the purpose of safeguarding their rights under Part III of our Constitution and the laws made by Parliament and the State Legislature.



W.P.(C).Nos.29247/2019 and 1970/2024

-:**7**:- 2024:KER:98332

- **135.2.** Transgender person's right to decide their self-identified gender is also upheld and the Centre and State Governments are directed to grant legal recognition of their gender identity such as male, female or as third gender.
- **135.3.** We direct the Centre and the State Governments to take steps to treat them as Socially and Educationally Backward Classes of citizens and extend all kinds of reservation in cases of admission in educational institutions and for public appointments.
- **135.4.** The Centre and State Governments are directed to operate separate HIV serosurveillance centres since hijras/transgenders face several sexual health issues.
- **135.5.** The Centre and State Governments should seriously address the problems being faced by hijras/transgenders such as fear, shame, gender dysphoria, social pressure, depression, suicidal tendencies, social stigma, etc. and any insistence for SRS for declaring one's gender is immoral and illegal.
- **135.6.** The Centre and State Governments should take proper measures to provide medical care to TGs in the hospitals and also provide them separate public toilets and other facilities.
- **135.7.** The Centre and State Governments should also take steps for framing various social welfare schemes for their betterment.



W.P.(C).Nos.29247/2019 and 1970/2024

-:**8**:- 2024:KER:98332

- **135.8.** The Centre and State Governments should take steps to create public awareness so that TGs will feel that they are also part and parcel of the social life and be not treated as untouchables.
- **135.9.** The Centre and the State Governments should also take measures to regain their respect and place in the society which once they enjoyed in our cultural and social life.
- **136.** We are informed an expert committee has already been constituted to make an in-depth study of the problems faced by the transgender community and suggest measures that can be taken by the Government to ameliorate their problems and to submit its report with the recommendations within three months of its constitution. Let the recommendations be examined based on the legal declaration made in this judgment and implemented within six months.
- **137.** The writ petitions are, accordingly, allowed as above."
- 3. In the light of the declaration of law, effectuating measures to protect their rights cannot be said to be a matter that completely falls within the domain of the Executive. The law declared by the Apex Court is essential to ensure that transgenders



2024:KER:98332

W.P.(C).Nos.29247/2019 and 1970/2024

are equally treated along with other gender groups, to take proactive measures for affirmative action.

-:9:-

- Innate human differences are a challenge to human 4. civilization. We must be alive to acknowledge that the different groups face structural and societal disadvantages that prevent them from competing on equal footing. It is the mandate of the dismantled that such barriers are to law ensure egual opportunities. If there is a difference existing due to biological reasons or any other reasons like ethnicity, social class, etc., the State is bound to address such differences to bridge the gap and allow the participation of disadvantaged groups along with others.
- 5. The Parliament understood the significant issue faced by the transgenders in the light of the law declared by the Apex Court in the **National Legal Service Authority's** case (supra). The Parliament accordingly enacted The Transgender Persons (Protection of Rights) Act, 2019. It is appropriate to refer to Section 3 of the above enactment which reads as follows:



W.P.(C).Nos.29247/2019 and 1970/2024

-:10:-

2024:KER:98332

- "3. Prohibition against discrimination No person or establishment shall discriminate against a transgender person on any of the following grounds, namely:
- (a) the denial, or discontinuation of, or unfair treatment in, educational establishments and services thereof;
 - (b) the unfair treatment in, or in relation to, employment or occupation;
 - (c) the denial of, or termination from, employment or occupation;
- (d) the denial or discontinuation of, or unfair treatment in, healthcare services;
- (e) the denial or discontinuation of, or unfair treatment with regard to, access to, or provision or enjoyment or use of any goods, accommodation, service, facility, benefit, privilege or opportunity dedicated to the use of the general public or customarily available to the public;
- (f) the denial or discontinuation of, or unfair treatment with regard to the right of movement;
- (g) the denial or discontinuation of, or unfair treatment with regard to the right to reside, purchase, rent, or otherwise occupy any property;
- (h) the denial or discontinuation of, or unfair treatment in, the opportunity to stand for or hold public or private office; and
- (i) the denial of access to, removal from, or unfair treatment in, Government or private establishment in whose care or custody a transgender person may be."

The Government of Kerala also framed rules in accordance with the above enactment in the year 2020 to effectuate the objectives and goals of the statutory provisions.



W.P.(C).Nos.29247/2019 and 1970/2024

-:**11**:- 2024:KER:98332

6. In effect, in the absence of any statutory provisions or executive orders providing for reservation of education in public employment, the agony faced by the transgenders continues and they are not in a position to compete with advantaged groups. Thereby, they have been denied equal opportunity in education and public employment. Education is a fundamental human right. Our Constitution provides equal opportunity as a part of the fundamental rights. Unequals have different sets of backgrounds while competing and they would be denied equal opportunity if the circumstances leading to their inequality are not addressed. Equality is the basic feature of our Constitution.

The petitioners in these cases are aspirants of public employment. In none of the public employment notifications, a reservation is made for transgenders. The transgenders are marginalised. Their inclusion in education and public employment is imperative for development. Their voices are not heard in public employment. They also need to move forward. In the light of the



W.P.(C).Nos.29247/2019 and 1970/2024

-:12:-

2024:KER:98332

Apex Court judgment in **National Legal Service Authority's** case (supra), the Government cannot delay the implementation of their rights in providing reservations to them. In such circumstances, we are of the view that the Government shall implement measures to provide reservations to transgenders within six months from the date of receipt of a copy of this judgment.

The writ petitions are disposed of as above.

Sd/-

A.MUHAMED MUSTAQUE, JUDGE

Sd/-

P. KRISHNA KUMAR, JUDGE

ms



W.P.(C).Nos.29247/2019 and 1970/2024

-:**13:-** 2024:KER:98332

APPENDIX OF WP(C) 1970/2024

PETITIONER EXHIBITS

Exhibit P1	TRUE COPY OF THE TRANSGENDER IDENTITY CARD ISSUED BY THE DISTRICT MAGISTRATE/COLLECTOR, PALAKKAD
Exhibit P2	TRUE COPY OF THE IDENTITY CARD ISSUED BY GOVERNMENT OF KERALA
Exhibit P3	TRUE COPIES OF THE B.A DEGREE CERTIFICATE ISSUED BY THE UNIVERSITY OF CALICUT
Exhibit P4	TRUE COPIES OF THE B.ED DEGREE CERTIFICATES ISSUED BY THE UNIVERSITY OF CALICUT
Exhibit P5	TRUE COPY OF THE M.ED CERTIFICATE
Exhibit P6	TRUE COPY OF THE RESERVATION RULE FOLLOWED BY THE KERALA PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION
Exhibit P7	TRUE COPY OF THE NOTIFICATION FOR CATEGORY NO.517/2019 ISSUED BY THE KERALA PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION
Exhibit P8	TRUE COPY OF THE SUPREME COURT JUDGMENT IN NALSA V. UNION OF INIDA(AIR 2014 SC 1863)
Exhibit P9	TRUE COPY OF THE NOTIFICATION FOR CATEGORY NO.203/2021 ISSUED BY THE KERALA PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION
Exhibit 10	TRUE COPY OF THE TRANSGENDER PERSONS (PROTECTION OF RIGHTS) ACT, 2019
Exhibit 11	TRUE COPY OF THE LETTER GIVEN TO THE DISTRICT LEGAL SERVICES AUTHORITY, PALAKKAD DISTRICT ON 14/12/2021



W.P.(C).Nos.29247/2019 and 1970/2024

-:**14**:- 2024:KER:98332

RESPONDENT EXHIBITS

EXHIBIT R1(a)	TRUE COPY OF THE G.O. (Ms.) No. 153/2018/HEDN DATED 03.07.2018
EXHIBIT R1(b)	TRUE COPY OF THE G.O. (Ms.) No. 172/2023/HFWD DATED 27.07.2023
EXHIBIT R1(c)	TRUE COPY OF THE G.O.(Ms.) No. 61/2015/SJD DATED 22.09.2015
EXHIBIT R1(d)	TRUE COPY OF THE MINUTES OF MEETING HELD ON 20.09.2023.



W.P.(C).Nos.29247/2019 and 1970/2024

-:15:-2024:KER:98332

<u>APPENDIX OF WP(C)</u> 29247/2019

PETITIONER'S EXHIBITS

EXHIBIT P1	TRUE COPY OF THE G.O. DATED 22.9.2015 ISSUED BY THE SECRETARY, DEPARTMENT OF SOCIAL JUSTICE.
EXHIBIT P2	TRUE COPY OF THE STATE POLICE FOR THE TRANSGENDERS IN KERALA.
EXHIBIT P3	TRUE COPY OF THE G.O. DATED 03.07.2018.
EXHIBIT P4	TRUE COPY OF THE REPORT TITLED 'SKILLING FOR LIVELIHOOD OPPORTUNITIES FOR TRANSGENDERS IN INDIA'.
EXHIBIT P5	TRUE COPY OF THE TRANSGENDER IDENTITY CARD OF THE PETITIONER ISSUED BY THE IST RESPONDENT.
EXHIBIT P6	TRUE COPY OF THE JUDGMENT OF THE MADRAS HIGH COURT IN WRIT PETITION NO.15046/15 DATED 03.11.2015.
EXHIBIT P7	TRUE COPY OF THE 'TRANSGENDER SURVEY KERALA 2014-15.
EXHIBIT P8	TRUE COPY OF THE JUDGMENT OF THE MADRAS HIGH COURT IN THARIKA BANU V. SECRETARY TO GOVERNMENT, HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE AND OTHERS (W.P.NO.26628/17).
RESPONDENTS	' ANNEXURES

True copy of the G.O.(Rt) No.612/2019/SJD Annexure R1(a) dated 29.09.2019 along with English Translation

Annexure R1(b) True copy of the report